The Long-Run Effects of Oil Wealth on Development: Evidence from Petroleum Geology

Authors: Traviss Cassidy

Discussion at the 109th Annual Conference of NTA (Nov. 10-12, 2016)

Discussant: Sutirtha Bagchi, Villanova University
What I like about the paper

(1) Is the research question of interest to us?

(2) Can the question be answered in the setting we have?

(3) Do the author(s) do a satisfactory job of exploiting the setting?
What I like about the paper

(1) Is the research question of interest to us?

(2) Can the question be answered in the setting we have?

(3) Do the author(s) do a satisfactory job of exploiting the setting?

The answer to every one of these questions is a resounding YES! It’s an important question in the social sciences, examined using a persuasive IV which allows for credible identification, and the author does a very careful job - both in piecing together a plethora of data sources
What the paper examines

- Research Qs.: What is the effect of oil wealth on development?

- Concern: Oil production is clearly endogenous; need to instrument oil wealth

- Instrument used: Data on the spatial distribution of sedimentary basins
Summary of findings

- Oil wealth negatively affects
  - Democracy &
  - Average tax revenue as a share of GDP

- Oil wealth leads to more purges of political rivals

- Oil wealth leads to higher GDP/capita

- Effects are concentrated among countries with weak institutional constraints on the executive
Suggestions

- Look for other outcomes of interest such as longevity and educational attainment; also on the variability in the level of democracy over the period 1966-2008

- For corruption also consider measure of corruption from the Transparency International’s Corruption indices

- Preferred IV: Area covered by basins 1 and 2 per 1,000 inhabitants
  - A discussion of why this IV performs better than other possible measures
  - Some discussion on the hydrocarbon productivity of basins of various kinds

- Rather than looking at all tax revenue, could one look at direct tax revenue? (Riezman and Slemrod, 1987)
Other thoughts

- Provide a case example (or two) pointing to the negative effects of oil wealth on development.

- Interpretation of coefficients is difficult; dependent variables are being expressed in log terms (e.g. Norway and Finland GDP per capita are 11.09 and 10.65 respectively).

- A slightly more detailed discussion of why the IV and OLS estimates differ for the various d.v.s.

- Assigning no oil as quality 1 seems odd.

- Discuss if this technique can be replicated to other contexts as well or is oil unique in some manner.